

**Forth Standards Committee**  
**Doubletree Hilton, Queensferry Crossing, Scotland**  
**12–14 September 2018**

**Draft Minutes**

## 1 Participants

PB	Paul Bennett	HIDEC Consultancy	England	
WB	Willem Botha	CCS	South Africa	
JD	Jermain Davies	CCS	South Africa	
AH	Andrew Haley	Red Hat, Cambridge	England	
UH	Ulrich Hoffmann	FH Wedel	Germany	
PK	Peter Knaggs	Independent, Trowbridge	England	(Editor)
BP	Bernd Paysan	Net2o	Germany	(Treasurer)
SP	Stephen Pelc	MPE	England	(Chair)
LW	Leon Wagner	FORTH, Inc.	USA	
GW	Gerald Wodni	Independent, Wien	Austria	(Technical)

- Sergey Baranov and Anton Ertl will be deemed to have resigned from the committee should they fail to attend the next meeting.
- Jermain Davies has become a full member of the committee.
- Paul Bennett became a full members of the committee at the last meeting, but was not minuted.

## 2 Review of procedures

1. Committee membership rules to be reviewed to allow for Proxy attendance. (8/0/0)  
**Action: PK/LW**
2. Minutes of all meetings should be made available on [www.forth-standard.org](http://www.forth-standard.org). (8/0/0)  
**Action: PK/GW**
3. Call for Votes to be conducted on [www.forth-standard.org](http://www.forth-standard.org). (8/0/0) **Action: PK/GW**
4. Allow for proposals that are not related to existing item. (8/0/0) **Action: GW**
5. Move proposal archive on [www.forth200x.org](http://www.forth200x.org) to [www.forth-standard.org](http://www.forth-standard.org) with signposting on [www.forth200x.org](http://www.forth200x.org). (8/0/0) **Action: AE/GW**
6. Add approved flag to libraries on [theForth.net](http://theForth.net) to be set by vote of the committee. (8/0/0) **Action: GW**
7. Add “Experimental Proposal” section to [www.forth-standard.org](http://www.forth-standard.org) where the committee can mark proposal for further experimentation and feedback. (8/0/0) **Action: GW**

## 3 Reports

### 3.1 Chair

No report given.

### 3.2 Editor

1. Results of the last meeting have been published on [www.forth200x.org](http://www.forth200x.org).  
Changes accepted with spelling changes (8/0/0)
2. The Quotations proposal did not actually propose any changes to the document. The editor has attempted to integrate the proposal into the document, but is unhappy with the result and would like feedback on this change.  
  
The meeting suggested moving Quotations to their own chapter, redefining `;`, `;CODE` and `DOES>` in that chapter. Changes left to the editor (8/0/0) **Action: AE/PK**
3. GitHub project exists, but has not been populated. Assistance requested in moving CVS archive on [www.forth200x.org](http://www.forth200x.org) to [github.com/PeterKnaggs/forth-standard](https://github.com/PeterKnaggs/forth-standard) would be appreciated. **Action: BP/GW/AE**

### 3.3 Technical

1. [www.forth-standard.org](http://www.forth-standard.org) is up and running with the Forth 2012 document, should it be displaying more recent rolling versions?
2. Proposals are not being submitted though the sight as per revised procedures (2017).  
See 7.3 Proposal workshop.
3. Assistance is sought to improve the proposal section of the site. **Action: GW**
4. Integrate the exiting Forth200x Committee web site ([forth200x.wodni.at](http://forth200x.wodni.at)) into [www.forth-standard.org](http://www.forth-standard.org) **Action: GW**
5. We should consider using video conferencing for electronic meetings.

### 3.4 Treasurer

Current balance: 0, no income, no outgoings, no bank account. Creating a bank account in Germany would require translating the founding documents into German. This should be done once the need for a bank account is established.

## 4 Review of proposals and activities

Proposal	Comments	Vote	Action
CS-DROP	Allowing CS-DROP to drop an <i>orig</i> was discussed, this would require allowing CS-PICK to pick an <i>orig</i> . Referred to author for further consideration	9/0/0	UH
Recognisers	Accepted as an experimental proposal. The Lexeme Readers discussion shows the need for further discussion.	8/0/0	GW

Internationalisation	Accepted as an experimental proposal.	9/0/0	<b>GW</b>
S(	Discussion moved to 7.4		<b>UH/SP</b>
Synonym	It was felt that rewording of the definition of <b>SYNONYM</b> would overcome the issues identified in a more succinct manner. Referred to author of original Synonym proposal to review.		<b>SP/BP</b>
Clarify Find	It was felt that the revised text was just as confusing as the text it was replacing and that changing <b>FIND</b> will cause just as much confusion. <b>FIND</b> should be deprecated after <b>FIND-NAME</b> has been standardised. Referred back to author.	10/0/0	<b>BP</b>
<b>FIND-NAME</b>	Accepted	9/0/1	<b>PK/AE</b>
Exception Locals	<b>AE</b> 's response was endorsed, and should be marked as being supported by the committee.	10/0/0	<b>GW</b>
BL Rationale	Referred to author to take through the proposal process	10/0/0	<b>AE/BP</b>
32-/64-bit floats	The standard does not specify the use of single or double precision floats. Referred back to author.	10/0/0	<b>AH</b>
Directories	Discussion moved to 7.1 and referred back to author.		<b>GW</b>
Multi-Tasking	Discussion moved to 6.2 and referred back to author.		<b>AH</b>
Experimental Proposals	Discussion moved to 7.3 and referred back to author.		<b>PK</b>
Forth200x.org	See 3.3.		<b>GW</b>
Test suite	A version has already been integrated into the document. Adopting updates will require additional changes on an ongoing bases. It was felt that endorsing the library would be a better approach.	8/0/0	<b>GW</b>
External function integration	Discussion moved to 7.2		<b>SP</b>

## 5 Consideration of proposals (CfVs)

See the review of proposals and activities (section 4).

## 6 Workshops

### 6.1 Recognisers

Version 4 of the recognisers proposal was accepted as an “experimental proposal”. See 4 proposals.

### 6.2 Multitasking

Attending: AH/PB/JD/WB/LW/SP/GW/PK

The Multi-Tasking proposal was presented and discussed, with feedback on testing the proposed word set sought by the author before bringing the proposal to the committee. **Action: AH**

### 6.3 NDCS Compilation

Attending: AH/PB/JD/WB/LW/GW/SP/PK/UH/BP

After some discussion, it was suggested the name NDCS (None Default Compilation Semantics) be changed to Dual (Dual Behaviour). The author was encouraged to bring this forward as an experimental proposal. **Action: SP**

### 6.4 Ambiguous Conditions

Attending: AH/PB/JD/WB/LW/GW/PK/UH/BP

The first 16 ambiguous conditions in section 4.1.2 were discussed.

- a name is neither a valid definition name nor a valid number during text interpretation;  
Section 9.3.4 indicates the system should throw a -13 (undefined word) exception, thus this is no longer an ambiguous condition.
- a definition name exceeded the maximum length allowed;  
Add the following to the end of the first paragraph of 3.3.1.2 (Definition names):  
Defining a name longer than the implementation defined limit will throw a -19 (definition name too long) exception.  
Thus removing this ambiguous condition.
- argument type incompatible with specified input parameter, e.g., passing a *flag* to a word expecting an *n* (3.1 Data types);  
The example is confusing and should be removed.
- insufficient space in the dictionary;  
Section 9.3.4 indicate the system should throw a -8 (dictionary overflow) exception, thus this is no longer an ambiguous condition.

These changes were accepted and will be integrated into the next revision of the document. (9/0/0) **Action: PK**

## 7 Matters Arising

### 7.1 Directories

Attending: AH/JD/WB/LW/GW/SP/PK/UH/BP

The directories proposal was presented and discussed, with feedback sought by the author before bringing the proposal to the committee. **Action: GW**

### 7.2 External function integration

Attending: LW/AH/SP/GW/BP

The idea of using the SwiftForth notation (as adapted by MPE and others) for integrating C functions into Forth was discussed. It was suggested that with minor changes this may be acceptable as a standard notation. **Action: SP/BP**

### 7.3 Experimental proposals

Attending: AH/LW/GW/PK

The “Proposal Process” in the front-matter of the document was rewritten to describe the new [www.forth-standard.org](http://www.forth-standard.org) based process of publishing proposals. A proposal has been raised to replace the existing text<sup>1</sup>. **Action: GW/PK**

### 7.4 Reservation of names

Whether or not to provide a method of reserving names within the document. This workshop was not held due to lack of time.

## 8 Any Other Business

None.

## 9 Date of Next Meeting

A video conference to be held some time early in the next year, exact date to be determined by the Technical officer and the Chair. A meeting time of 15:00 UTC is preferred. The format of the meeting to be two 1 hour sessions with a 15 minute break between the sessions. The agenda to be circulated by the Chair at least three months (according to the constitution) in advance of the meeting.

The next standards meeting will be held immediately before the next euroForth conference being held in Germany.

---

<sup>1</sup><http://forth-standard.org/standard/process#contribution-71>